MEETING AGENDA
Public Transportation Advisory Committee
Tuesday, July 28, 2020 | 10:00 A.M. (local time)
Texas Department of Transportation (TxDOT)
Virtual Meeting via Webex Events

1. Call to Order.
2. Guidance on virtual meeting participation.
3. Approval of minutes from April 28, 2020 meeting. (Action)
4. Approval of minutes from May 26, 2020 meeting. (Action)
5. Presentation and discussion on rural ridership trends. (Action)
6. Public Comment – Public comment will only be accepted during the meeting. Link and details are below. The meeting transcript will be posted on the internet following the meeting.
7. Propose and discuss agenda items for next meeting; confirm date of next meeting. (Action)
8. Adjourn. (Action)

I certify that I have reviewed this document and that it conforms to all applicable Texas Register filing requirements.

CERTIFYING OFFICIAL: Becky Blewett, Deputy General Counsel, (512) 463-8630.

***
The public is invited to attend this meeting and view meeting presentations via WebEx at https://txdot.webex.com/txdot/onstage/g.php?MTID=e4878933fbe8be845193b34cd76cf341e
For toll-free audio and best audio quality, select the option to have the meeting call you.
***
AGENDA ITEM 3

Approval of minutes from April 28, 2020 meeting. (Action)
AGENDA ITEM 1: Call to order.

John McBeth called the meeting to order at 10:05 A.M.

AGENDA ITEM 2: Safety briefing with guidance on virtual meeting participation

Josh Ribakove briefed meeting attendees on virtual meeting protocols including how public comments can be submitted via Webex at 10:07 A.M.

AGENDA ITEM 3: Approval of minutes from February 11, 2020 meeting (Action).

John McBeth opened this item at 10:08 A.M.

   MOTION   Marc K. Whyte moved to approve the February 11, 2020 minutes.

   SECOND   Jim Cline seconded the motion.

   Motion passed unanimously at 10:09 A.M.

AGENDA ITEM 4: TxDOT’s Public Transportation Division Director’s report to the committee regarding public transportation matters.

Eric Gleason delivered this report beginning at 10:10 A.M. The report touched on TxDOT’s potential return on onsite office work, anticipated upcoming Texas Transportation Commission action, bus safety plans, and the possibility of additional federal stimulus elements.

Questions/Comments: John McBeth

AGENDA ITEM 5: Presentation and discussion on projected 2020 Census impacts to public transportation funding for Texas transit providers (Action).
John McBeth introduced this item at 10:21 A.M. Item was tabled for this meeting by the committee. The presentation and discussion will take place at an upcoming meeting.

**MOTION**  Marc K. Whyte moved to table this item until the committee’s next meeting.

**SECOND**  J.R. Salazar seconded the motion.

Motion passed unanimously at 10:21 A.M.

**AGENDA ITEM 6: Coronavirus Aid, Relief, and Economic Security (CARES) Act – presentation and discussion of potential impacts of CARES Act funding on Texas’ rural public transportation program.**

John McBeth introduced this topic at 10:21 A.M. Eric Gleason presented and led the discussion.

Questions and comments: Jim Cline, John McBeth, Eric Gleason

**AGENDA ITEM 7: Discussion on exceptional items for 2022/2023 Legislative Appropriations Request, including additional funding due to 2020 US Census impacts (Action).**

John McBeth introduced this topic at 10:48 A.M. Eric Gleason presented.

Questions and comments: John McBeth, Eric Gleason, Jim Cline, Fen Fickes, J.R. Salazar

**MOTION**  Jim Cline moved to request PTN staff provide a recommendation for a baseline Legislative Appropriations Request sufficient to mitigate 2020 US Census impacts.

**SECOND**  Dietrich von Biedenfeld seconded the motion.

Motion passed unanimously at 10:57 A.M.

**MOTION**  Jim Cline moved that PTAC’s Legislative Appropriations Request letter to the Texas Transportation Commission should include an exceptional item request to fund the expansion of 14-hour weekday transit service.

**SECOND**  Ken Fickes seconded the motion.

Motion passed unanimously at 11:10 A.M.

**AGENDA ITEM 8: Public Comment**

John McBeth introduced this item at 11:12 A.M. There were no public comments.

**AGENDA ITEM 9: Propose and Discuss Agenda Items for Next Meeting; confirm date of next meeting (Action).**
John McBeth initiated and led this discussion beginning at 11:12 A.M.

Two meeting dates and their topics are in consideration:
- A special meeting in May to accommodate the presentation and discussion item on projected Census impact data that was tabled at today's meeting
- PTAC's regular meeting in July, to discuss TxDOT's 2019 Texas Transit Statistics Report and PTAC's Guiding Principles document

No specific meeting dates were chosen.

**AGENDA ITEM 10: Adjourn (Action).**

**MOTION**  J.R. Salazar moved to adjourn.

**SECOND**  Dietrich von Biedenfeld seconded the motion.

Motion passed unanimously at 11:16 A.M.

Meeting adjourned at 11:16 A.M.

Prepared by:                                     Approved by:

____________________________________________  ______________________________________
Josh Ribakove                                      John McBeth, Chair
Public Transportation Division                    Public Transportation Advisory Committee
AGENDA ITEM 4

Approval of minutes from May 26, 2020 meeting. (Action)
AGENDA ITEM 1: Call to order.

John McBeth called the meeting to order at 10:05 A.M.

AGENDA ITEM 2: Guidance on virtual meeting participation

Josh Ribakove briefed meeting attendees on virtual meeting protocols including how public comments can be submitted via Webex at 10:05 A.M.

AGENDA ITEM 3: Approval of minutes from April 28, 2020 meeting (Action).

John McBeth opened this item at 10:06 A.M. and suggested tabling it until the next meeting due to technical issues.

MOTION Jim Cline moved to table adopting the April 28, 2020 minutes until the next meeting.

SECOND Ken Fickes seconded the motion.

Motion passed unanimously at 10:07 A.M.

AGENDA ITEM 4: Presentation and discussion on projected 2020 US Census funding impacts to public transportation for Texas transit providers (Action).
Eric Gleason opened this item at 10:07, introducing presenter Michael Walk (TTI), who began at 10:09

Questions/Comments:
Jim Cline, John McBeth, Eric Gleason, J.R. Salazar, Marc Whyte

**MOTION**
Ken Fickes moved to recommend scenario 2 to the Texas Transportation Commission via PTAC’s Legislative Appropriations Request letter.

**SECOND**
J.R. Salazar seconded the motion.

Motion passed unanimously at 10:52 A.M.

**AGENDA ITEM 5: Public Comment**

John McBeth introduced this item at 10:53 A.M.

There was one public comment, from Harrison Humphreys, Air Alliance Houston. His comment was addressed by John McBeth and Eric Gleason.

**AGENDA ITEM 6: Propose and Discuss Agenda Items for Next Meeting; confirm date of next meeting (Action).**

John McBeth initiated and led this discussion beginning at 10:56 A.M.

No specific items were mentioned. Next meeting was set for July 28.

**AGENDA ITEM 7: Adjourn (Action).**

**MOTION**
Jim Cline moved to adjourn.

**SECOND**
Ken Fickes seconded the motion.

Motion passed unanimously at 10:57 A.M.

Meeting adjourned 10:57am

Prepared by:     Approved by:
__________________________  _________________________________
Josh Ribakove    John McBeth, Chair
Public Transportation Division    Public Transportation Advisory Committee
AGENDA ITEM 5

Presentation and discussion on rural ridership trends. (Action)
Texas Rural Ridership Trends

July 28, 2020
Key Takeaways

• Rural ridership is generally decreasing since 2014

• There is no singular identifiable cause for rural transit ridership decline

• Each region is unique and poses different challenges and outcomes for transit ridership
Background

• Texas rural ridership (unlinked passenger trips) trended down since 2014.

• TTI conducted research to determine reasons for decline. Research included:
  • Literature review of ridership trends across U.S.
  • Analysis of Texas rural ridership data.
  • Review of contributing factors.
  • Transit agency perspectives.
Texas Rural Ridership Analysis

Rural Analysis

- Ridership Data (Reviewing for errors/outliers)
  - 2014-2018

- Ridership Change by Funding Source

- Population Change
  - 2014-2018
### Total Passenger Trips 2014 vs. 2018

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2014 Passenger Trips</th>
<th>2018 Passenger Trips</th>
<th>Total Change</th>
<th>Percentage Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Original Total</strong></td>
<td>6,512,765</td>
<td>4,624,135</td>
<td>-1,888,630</td>
<td>-29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Without Galveston</strong>*</td>
<td>5,651,843</td>
<td>4,624,135</td>
<td>-1,027,708</td>
<td>-18%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Galveston counted as rural transit district in 2014; not a rural transit district in 2018.

**Quality Review: Removing Galveston**
Gradual upward trend since 2016 for total ridership.

Remaining analysis focuses on 2014-2018 trend.

*Does Not Include Galveston*
### Total Passenger Trips 2014 vs. 2018

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2014 Passenger Trips</th>
<th>2018 Passenger Trips</th>
<th>Total Change</th>
<th>Percentage Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Original Total</td>
<td>6,512,765</td>
<td>4,624,135</td>
<td>-1,888,630</td>
<td>-29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Without Galveston*</td>
<td>5,651,843</td>
<td>4,624,135</td>
<td>-1,027,708</td>
<td>-18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Without Identified Data Issues**</td>
<td>4,917,642</td>
<td>4,624,135</td>
<td>-531,659</td>
<td>-6%***</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Galveston counted as rural transit district in 2014; not a rural transit district in 2018.
**Removal of transit districts with data reporting problems in 2014.
***Represents a floor for ridership loss. Actual ridership loss falls between 6% and 18%
Rural Ridership Trend

Gradual upward trend since 2016 for total ridership.

Remaining analysis focuses on 2014-2018 trend.

*Does Not Include Galveston*
Percentage Change in Ridership 2014 vs. 2018

- McLennan County Rural (R16) has no data in 2014
- Map does not include Galveston.

Transit District Name Reference on Slide 21
# Funding Sources 2014-2018

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Funding Sources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>General Public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section 5310 Elderly &amp; Disabled</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section 5316 JARC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section 5317 New Freedom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CMAQ</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Transit districts used a variety of funding sources

*Does Not Include Galveston*
### Funding Sources 2014-2018

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Funding Sources</th>
<th>Project/Programs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>General Public</td>
<td>Medical Transportation Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section 5310 Elderly &amp; Disabled</td>
<td>DADS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section 5316 JARC</td>
<td>DARS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section 5317 New Freedom</td>
<td>Head Start</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CMAQ</td>
<td>Local Contracts</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These three programs accounted for 93% of ridership loss

- Decrease in general public trips
- Decrease in MTP trips
- Decrease in JARC (discontinued program)

*Does Not Include Galveston*
General Public vs. JARC Trend

- General public trips increase in 2017.
- Funding for JARC was consolidated into 5311 and 5307.

*Does Not Include Galveston
Texas Transit District Population Change 2013 vs. 2017

Population increased in both rural and urban areas from 2013 to 2017.

- Rural: +13%.
- Urban: +6.3%.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Transit District Type</th>
<th>2013 Total Population</th>
<th>2017 Total Population</th>
<th>Total Change</th>
<th>Percentage Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>7,217,389</td>
<td>8,155,485</td>
<td>938,096</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>5,222,619</td>
<td>5,550,945</td>
<td>328,326</td>
<td>6.3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TTI used existing transit district population data from 2013 and 2017; data for 2018 were not readily available at the time of analysis.
Analyzing Contributing Factors

Contributing Factors

- Strong economy
- Shifting demographics
- Transit service quality
- Alternative modes
- Delivery services
National Highlights

1. Rise in car purchases (low gas prices and low interest rates).
2. More service days, low fares, short reservation periods (DR) can increase ridership.
3. Alternative modes of transportation and delivery services might reduce transit trips.

From Literature Review
Texas Highlights

- Texans’ personal income grew at 3.7% annually.
- Gas prices followed national trend (see chart).
- Wider availability of delivery services in rural areas; TNCs are limited.
• Reached out to 15 transit agencies based on ridership trends, and effectiveness trends (passengers per revenue hour/ revenue mile).
• Four agencies sat for a phone interview.
• Statewide Trend - Agency Perspectives:
  • Rural population decline.
  • Increased car ownership.
  • Cost of fares.
  • Increase in rideshare services.
  • Lack of awareness of transit service.
  • Perceived safety concerns on transit.
## Transit Agency Perspective

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>2014 Passenger Trips</th>
<th>2018 Passenger Trips</th>
<th>Total Change</th>
<th>Percentage Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Community Services, Inc.</td>
<td>94,647</td>
<td>56,213</td>
<td>-38,434</td>
<td>-41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East Texas Council of Governments</td>
<td>122,295</td>
<td>92,117</td>
<td>-30,178</td>
<td>-25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>El Paso, County of</td>
<td>367,299</td>
<td>384,881</td>
<td>17,582</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Texas Opportunities, Inc.</td>
<td>141,175</td>
<td>103,746</td>
<td>-37,429</td>
<td>-27%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Targeted Agency Perspective:

- Some agencies have been more impacted by reducing their Medical Transportation Program trips.
- Marketing services is important.
- Service area and demographics are unique to each transit district and may contribute to ridership declines or increases.
• Rural ridership loss is occurring, but it is not as large as it appeared:
  • Appeared to be 29% loss from 2014 vs. 2018, but after removing Galveston & data issues, the range falls between 6% and 18% loss.
  • Gradual upward trend since 2016.

• Several contributing factors for ridership loss:
  • Personal income growth in Texas.
  • Low gas prices, national trend of car purchases.
  • More delivery services may be replacing some trips.

• Ridership trends vary across rural transit districts.
Questions?
## Transit District Map Reference:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TDID</th>
<th>NAME</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>R01</td>
<td>Alamo Area Council of Governments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R02</td>
<td>Ark-Tex Council of Governments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R03</td>
<td>Aspermont Small Business Development Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R05</td>
<td>Central Texas Rural Transit District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R06</td>
<td>City of Cleburne</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R07</td>
<td>Colorado Valley Transit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R08</td>
<td>Community Services, Inc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R09</td>
<td>City of Del Rio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R10</td>
<td>East Texas Council of Governments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R11</td>
<td>County of El Paso</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R12</td>
<td>County of Fort Bend</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R13</td>
<td>Galveston County Rural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R14</td>
<td>Heart of Texas Council of Governments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R15</td>
<td>Kleberg County Human Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R16</td>
<td>McLennan County Rural Transit District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R17</td>
<td>Panhandle Community Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R18</td>
<td>Public Transit Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R19</td>
<td>Rolling Plains Management Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R20</td>
<td>Rural Economic Assistance League, Inc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R21</td>
<td>Senior Center Resources &amp; Public Transit, Inc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R22</td>
<td>Span, Inc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R23</td>
<td>South East Texas Regional Planning Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R24</td>
<td>City of South Padre Island</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R25</td>
<td>South Plains Community Action Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R26</td>
<td>Southwest Area Regional Transit District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R27</td>
<td>STAR Transit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R28</td>
<td>The Transit System, Inc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R29</td>
<td>Webb County Community Action Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R30</td>
<td>West Texas Opportunities, Inc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UR01</td>
<td>Brazos Transit District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UR02</td>
<td>Concho Valley Transit District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UR03</td>
<td>Golden Crescent Regional Planning Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UR04</td>
<td>Gulf Coast Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UR05</td>
<td>Hill Country Transit District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UR06</td>
<td>Lower Rio Grande Valley Development Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UR07</td>
<td>Texoma Area Paratransit System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UR08</td>
<td>Capital Area Rural Transportation System</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Thank You

Jimmy Cardenas, Associate Transportation Researcher
j-cardenas@tti.tamu.edu

Project Team
Zachary Elgart, Associate Research Scientist
Jinuk Hwang, Assistant Transportation Researcher
Ahmad Mahmoudzadeh, Graduate Assistant Researcher
Kelly Blume, Associate Research Scientist
Michael Walk, Research Scientist, Transit Mobility Program Manager